Are We There Yet? The Long and Winding Road to Global Learning for All

Madeleine F. Green
Senior Fellow
International Association of Universities and NAFSA

Today’s Topics

• Creating a Language Map: Internationalization and global learning
• Watching the Road: Factors shaping internationalization and global learning
• Navigating: Approaches to global learning for all and assessment
I. CREATING A LANGUAGE MAP:

INTERNATIONALIZATION AND GLOBAL LEARNING

Internationalization

Internationalization at the nation, sector, and institutional levels is defined as the process of integrating an international, intercultural or global dimension into the purpose, functions, or delivery of (postsecondary) education (Knight 2003).

The intentional process of integrating an international, intercultural or global dimension into the purpose, function, and delivery of post-secondary education, in order to enhance the quality of education and research for all students and staff, and to make a meaningful contribution to society (deWit, H, 2015).
Global Learning

Global learning is a critical analysis of and engagement with complex, interdependent global systems and legacies (such as natural, physical, social, cultural, economic, and political) and their implications for people’s lives and earth’s sustainability...

(Source: AAC&U Value Rubric)

Relating Internationalization to Student Learning Outcomes: Logic Model

GOALS

INPUTS
INVESTMENTS
Funding, infrastructure, leadership, faculty development

ACTIVITIES/PROGRAMS
Study abroad, Int’l of the curric., numbers of participants

OUTPUTS
RESULTS
What have students learned? What can they do? E.g. student engagement w.r.t social action,

OUTCOMES

IMPACT
SO WHAT?
Long term impact. Effect of other stakeholders—faculty, international students, partners, community?
Common Approaches to Global Learning

1. Knowledge, Skills, Attitudes/ Dispositions
2. AAC&U Value Rubric
3. Graduate Competencies/Proficiencies

Knowledge/Skills/Attitudes

KNOWLEDGE

• Analyze the global context of their chosen profession, and apply perspectives gathered from a global community of scholars as part of their professional expertise.
• Describe how, in multi-cultural or multi-national situations, individual and collective decision-making often generates ethical dilemmas, conflicts, and trade-offs that must be thoughtfully evaluated, weighed, and resolved.
• Explain how local features (economic, cultural, social, political and religious) of urban or rural communities, ethnicities, nations and regions are often linked to global trends, tendencies, and characteristics that often mutually shape one another.
Knowledge, Skills, and Attitudes

SKILLS
• Analyze the forces shaping international events, both now and in the past.
• Demonstrate effective and appropriate communication, interaction, and teamwork with people of different nationalities and cultures.
• Implement diverse frames of reference to critically examine and address complex global problems.
• Use world language skills and/or knowledge of other cultures to seek access to information, engage in experiences, and document new understandings.

Knowledge, Skills, Attitudes

ATTITUDES
• Demonstrate respect and support for the common good of the world community, including attention to internationally recognized human rights, self-determination, the welfare of others, economic development and international trade, and sustainability of natural and constructed systems.
• Demonstrate awareness of the complexity of cultural systems by describing the role that cultures play in influencing individual behavior, attitudes, and beliefs.
• Justify openness to difference, and tolerance of ambiguity and unfamiliarity. Seek clarification and explain the benefits of being in the position of a learner when encountering others in multi-cultural or global environments.
• Demonstrate an ongoing willingness to seek out international or intercultural opportunities, and describe how personal and social responsibility has been demonstrated through active involvement with diverse communities and real-world challenges.

U OF KENTUCKY
FIU Global Learning Outcomes

- **Global Awareness**: Knowledge of the interrelatedness of local, global, international, and intercultural issues, trends and systems
- **Global Perspective**: the ability to conduct a multi-perspective analysis of local, global, international, and intercultural problems
- **Global Engagement**: Willingness to engage in local, global, international, and intercultural problem solving

AAC&U Value Rubric

- Global Self-Awareness
- Perspective Taking
- Cultural Diversity
- Personal and Social Responsibility
- Understanding Global Systems
- Applying Knowledge to Contemporary Global Contexts
Graduate Proficiencies (DQP)

At the bachelor’s level, the student
• Explains diverse positions, including those representing different cultural, economic and geographic interests, on a contested public issue, and evaluates the issue in light of both those interests and evidence drawn from journalism and scholarship.
• Develops and justifies a position on a public issue and relates this position to alternate views held by the public or within the policy environment.
• Collaborates with others in developing and implementing an approach to a civic issue, evaluates the strengths and weaknesses of the process, and, where applicable, describes the result.
• Identifies a significant issue affecting countries, continents or cultures, presents quantitative evidence of that challenge through tables and graphs, and evaluates the activities of either non-governmental organizations or cooperative inter-governmental initiatives in addressing that issue.

Questions

• What terms do you use on campus? Are there common definitions? How did you arrive at them?
• Are there articulated global learning outcomes? How are they constructed?
• Do they apply to all students (institution-wide)? Some (general education or program level)?
II. WATCHING THE ROAD:

FACTORS SHAPING INTERNATIONALIZATION AND GLOBAL LEARNING

Factors Shaping Internationalization and Global Learning

HE PICTURE
Intl and National Trends in Intlz & GL

BIG PICTURE
International and National Context

CAMPUS PICTURE
Campus Envmt (Intlz & Assessment)

Intlz & Global Learning
BIG PICTURE

• Rise of nationalism and xenophobia
• Backlash to globalization
• Belief in American exceptionalism
• Diminished stature of US
• Everyone speaks English

HIGHER ED PICTURE

• Cost
• Quality and relevance
• HE as a political battleground
• Anti-intellectualism
• Facts don’t matter
• HE’s diminished role in influencing the marketplace of ideas
CAMPUS PICTURE:
INTERNATIONALIZATION

Campus culture and history with internationalization

– Mission statement and/or strategic plan
– Infrastructure and support
– Curriculum and co-curriculum, SLOs
– Faculty policies and practices
– International partnerships

• Comparisons with other institutions
• Relationship between internationalization and issues of domestic diversity

QUESTIONS

• Which of these contextual factors are most evident in your region? At play on your campus?
• How are they being addressed? By whom?
Growth in importance of Internationalization to HE leadership

Source: IAU 4th Global Survey

Figure H.4
Institutions according to institution-wide learning outcomes

Source: IAU 4th Global Survey
Figure B.1
Institutions according to policy/strategy for internationalization

Source: IAU 4th Global Survey

U.S. Trends in Campus Internationalization

PRIORITY ACTIVITIES FOR INTERNATIONALIZATION

#1: Increasing study abroad for U.S. students
#2: Recruiting international students
#3: Partnerships with institutions
#4: Internationalizing the curriculum/co-curriculum
#5: Faculty development

Source: ACE Mapping Internationalization 2017
REPORTED OVERALL LEVEL OF INSTITUTIONAL INTERNATIONALIZATION IN RECENT YEARS

Figure 2. Report on overall level of institutional internationalization in recent years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Very high</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Moderate</th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Very low</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE: ACE MAPPING 2017

Institutions with GLOs & Efforts to Internationalize the Curriculum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Doctoral</th>
<th>Master’s</th>
<th>Bachelor’s</th>
<th>Associate</th>
<th>Special Focus</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Are there specified international or global student learning outcomes at your institution?</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes (total)</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes for all students</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, for students in some schools, departments or programs</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does your institution offer any undergraduate degree?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is your institution currently engaged in any initiatives to internationalize the undergraduate curriculum?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ACE Mapping Internationalization 2017
LEVEL AT WHICH INTERNATIONALIZATION EFFORTS TAKE PLACE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Doc</th>
<th>MA</th>
<th>Bacc</th>
<th>Assoc</th>
<th>Spec</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INSTITUTION</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHOOL</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEPARTMENT</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDIVIDUAL COURSE</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE: ACE MAPPING 2017

---

**Intl/Global Component to Gen Ed Requirement**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Doc</th>
<th>MA</th>
<th>Bacc</th>
<th>Assoc</th>
<th>Spec</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions

How does your institution compare to the international and national data?
   – Level of importance of internationalization?
   – Priority areas for internationalization?
   – Existence of GLOs?
   – Efforts to internationalize the curriculum?

3. NAVIGATING GLOBAL LEARNING AND ASSESSMENT
Campus Environment for Assessment

- History with assessment
- Alignment of various levels
- Faculty attitudes and faculty development
- Leadership and structures
- Use of results

The Process

- Develop agreed upon goals (align institutional, division/department, gen.ed, individual course goals)
- Assemble the “right group” to lead the assessment effort
- Develop an assessment plan
- Write clear and measurable outcomes
- Decide on scope of the assessment
- Decide which outcomes will be assessed
Strategies for GL for All

- GL outcomes for ALL graduates
- Mapping outcomes against the curriculum and other learning opportunities
  - General Education
  - Disciplines/ majors
  - Education abroad
  - Co-curriculum
  - Service Learning

ALIGNING GLOs

SOURCE: ACE WEBSITE
Doing Assessment

- Identify multiple assessment tools
- Address technical issues
- Implement data collection
- Interpret data
- Summarize results in report

Doing Assessment

- Communicate results
- Discuss implications of results for program improvement
- Decide on actions to be taken
- Assess the assessment process, suggestions for improvement in next cycle.
What Works

• Faculty led
• A culture of inquiry, not compliance
• Sufficient support
• Make it manageable
• Make it useful

Summing Up

• Context matters: What is your context (external and internal) for internationalization and for assessment?
• It’s hard to move the conversation from outputs to the outcomes and impact
• Global learning for all requires looking at all the learning opportunities available to students
Summing Up

• A coherent approach to global learning for all requires coordination, collaboration among faculty, across departments and units.
• If assessment isn’t useful to faculty, it won’t go anywhere. What do they want to know?