Using Holistic Rubrics to Assess General Education Learning Outcomes

Jeffrey A. Seybert, Ph.D., consultant
National Higher Education Benchmarking Institute
Johnson County Community College

Steps in Designing an Assessment Process:

- Identify Outcomes
- Articulate and Operationally Define Outcomes
- Select Assessment Methodology
- Establish Standards
- Devise System for Use of Assessment Results
- Devise System to Evaluate Assessment Model
- Pilot Test
- Implement
Common Gen. Ed. Outcomes

- Writing
- Speaking
- Math
- Critical Thinking & Problem Solving
- Technology
- Appreciation of Diversity/Multiculturalism
- Social Responsibility/citizenship

Operationally Defined Outcome: Math

1. Identifies data necessary to solve the problem
2. Analyzes data correctly
3. Justifies results of analysis
Assessment Methodologies: Three Major Categories

- “Real-World” Experiences
- Course-Related/Course Connected
- Testing

Our Choice: Course Related

- Performance-based model
- Use work students produce in class (student artifacts)
- Obviates standardized testing “motivation to perform well’’ issues
- Several ways to collect artifacts
  1. All-college “Assessment Day”
  2. Sample classes with assignments relevant to outcome
  3. Common assessment assignment in relevant classes
- Several ways to score/analyze artifacts using rubrics
  1. Relevant faculty departmental/discipline teams
  2. Interdisciplinary faculty teams
  3. All faculty
What is a Rubric?

• A scoring rubric is a set of ordered categories to which a given piece of work (e.g., a student “artifact”) can be compared. Scoring rubrics specify the qualities or processes that must be exhibited in order for a performance to be assigned a particular evaluative rating (McDaniel, 1994).

Types of Rubrics

Rubrics may be:

• General—they contain criteria that are general across tasks
  – Designed to provide general guidance as to expectations, such as evaluation of written assignments (e.g., a “writing rubric”)

• Task-specific—they are unique to a specific task assignment
  – Designed to provide detailed guidance regarding a specific assignment or task (e.g., a rubric for the “civil war writing assignment”)
Types of Rubrics

- Checklists
- Analytic
- Holistic

Checklist Rubrics

- Checklist rubrics contain a list of behaviors or specific steps which can be marked as Present/Absent, Complete/Incomplete, Yes/No
  - Useful to note the completion of a task but when assignment of a rating scale is not necessary
Analytic Rubrics

• Analytic rubrics employ rating scales to provide specific feedback along several dimensions
  — Assignments/artifacts can be broken down into separate components (e.g., description, analysis, grammar, references, etc.)
  — Scales can include terms (e.g., novice, intermediate, and proficient) or specific point values (0, 1, 2, 3, 4)

Holistic Rubrics

• Holistic rubrics provide overall evaluation guidelines that clarify how assessments relate to performance achievement
  — There is one overall score instead of discrete dimensions
Points to Ponder

1. The perfect data fallacy
   • Measurement in higher education is imprecise
2. Assessment is messy
3. Resistance to change
   • Individual and organizational inertia

Rules for the Upcoming Exercises

1. Each team must report only one score per artifact (i.e., as a team, you must agree on a single score)
2. The score you report must be a whole number—no decimals, no fractions