

Using Holistic Rubrics to Assess General Education Learning Outcomes

Jeffrey A. Seybert, Ph.D., consultant
National Higher Education Benchmarking Institute
Johnson County Community College

Steps in Designing an Assessment Process:

- Identify Outcomes
- Articulate and Operationally Define Outcomes
- Select Assessment Methodology
- Establish Standards
- Devise System for Use of Assessment Results
- Devise System to Evaluate Assessment Model
- Pilot Test
- Implement

Common Gen. Ed. Outcomes

- Writing
- Speaking
- Math
- Critical Thinking & Problem Solving
- Technology
- Appreciation of Diversity/Multiculturalism
- Social Responsibility/citizenship

Operationally Defined Outcome: Math

1. Identifies data necessary to solve the problem
2. Analyzes data correctly
3. Justifies results of analysis

Assessment Methodologies: Three Major Categories

- ❖ “Real-World” Experiences
- ❖ Course-Related/Course Connected
- ❖ Testing

Our Choice: Course Related

- ❖ Performance-based model
- ❖ Use work students produce in class (student artifacts)
- ❖ Obviates standardized testing “motivation to perform well’ issues
- ❖ Several ways to collect artifacts
 1. All-college “Assessment Day”
 2. Sample classes with assignments relevant to outcome
 3. Common assessment assignment in relevant classes
- ❖ Several ways to score/analyze artifacts using rubrics
 1. Relevant faculty departmental/discipline teams
 2. Interdisciplinary faculty teams
 3. All faculty

What is a Rubric?

- A scoring rubric is a set of ordered categories to which a given piece of work (e.g., a student “artifact”) can be compared. Scoring rubrics specify the qualities or processes that must be exhibited in order for a performance to be assigned a particular evaluative rating (McDaniel, 1994).

Types of Rubrics

Rubrics may be:

- General—they contain criteria that are general across tasks
 - Designed to provide general guidance as to expectations, such as evaluation of written assignments (e.g., a “writing rubric”)
- Task-specific—they are unique to a specific task assignment
 - Designed to provide detailed guidance regarding a specific assignment or task (e.g., a rubric for the “civil war writing assignment”)

Types of Rubrics

- Checklists
- Analytic
- Holistic

Checklist Rubrics

- Checklist rubrics contain a list of behaviors or specific steps which can be marked as Present/Absent, Complete/Incomplete, Yes/No
 - Useful to note the completion of a task but when assignment of a rating scale is not necessary

Analytic Rubrics

- Analytic rubrics employ rating scales to provide specific feedback along several dimensions
 - Assignments/artifacts can be broken down into separate components (e.g., description, analysis, grammar, references, etc.)
 - Scales can include terms (e.g., novice, intermediate, and proficient) or specific point values (0, 1, 2, 3, 4)

Holistic Rubrics

- Holistic rubrics provide overall evaluation guidelines that clarify how assessments relate to performance achievement
 - There is one overall score instead of discrete dimensions

Points to Ponder

1. The perfect data fallacy
 - Measurement in higher education is imprecise
2. Assessment is messy
3. Resistance to change
 - Individual and organizational inertia

Rules for the Upcoming Exercises

1. Each team must report only one score per artifact (i.e., as a team, you **must** agree on a single score)
2. The score you report must be a whole number—no decimals, no fractions