Lessons Learned: Curriculum Map as an Assessment Tool

Dr. Paul J. Antonellis, Jr.
Director of Assessment
Endicott College
Beverly, MA

Dr. Laura Douglass
Dean, Van Loan School
Endicott College
Beverly, MA

2021 Assessment Institute: Leading Improvements in Higher Education

Paul J. Antonellis, Jr., Ed.D.
- Doctor of Education, Master's Degree in Labor & Policy Studies;
- Director of Assessment - Office of the Provost, Endicott College
- Affiliated Board Member - New England Educational Assessment Network
- Assistant Professor - Management Department, Girard School of Business, Merrimack College (7 years);
- Director of Business Programs - Granite State College (1 year);
- Taught more than 100 undergraduate and graduate courses over the past 15 years;
- Retired Fire Chief: 20 years in the fire/EMS field.
Laura Douglass, Ph.D.

- Ph.D. Interdisciplinary Education
- Dean, Van Loan School of Professional Studies, Endicott College
- Board Member - Journal of Adult and Continuing Education
- Assistant Professor

Endicott College - Quick Facts

- Academics:
  - AD, BD, MD, DD, Certificates (1453 degrees, 2019)
  - Four-Year Internship Program
- Student & Faculty:
  - 5,038 Total Enrollment
  - 112 Full-time Faculty
  - 478 Part-time Faculty
  - 16.5 Average Class Size
- Main campus in Beverly, Mass. (235 acres, 56 buildings)
  - Academic site in Boston, MA
  - International sites: Czech Republic, Spain, and Switzerland
  - 18 instructional locations in New England
Learning Outcomes:

1) Discuss lessons learned on the steps taken to use curriculum mapping as an assessment tool.

2) Discuss the strengths and weaknesses to building a shared governance assessment process with curriculum.

3) Describe when and how program outcomes are assessed in each course, while creating an assessment cycle for assessment.

The assessment process is to improve student learning.

The goal of the assessment process is to allow for data-based decisions.
Alignment of Student Learning Outcome

- **EC** Mission & Values
- Institutional Learning Outcomes
- Program Learning & General Education Outcomes
- Course Learning Outcomes

**Aligning Institution, Program, and Course Outcomes.**

**BUSINESS PROGRAM -- Critical Thinking**

**INSTITUTION**
Graduates of our College will be critical thinkers...

**PROGRAM**
...Business majors will think critically about ethics...

**COURSE**
...by the end of the semester, students in Business Ethics will specify how business can promote ethical behavior.
Aligning Institution, Program, and Course Outcomes.

NURSING PROGRAM - Critical Thinking

Institution
Graduates of our College will be critical thinkers...

Program
...Synthesize knowledge from nursing and related disciplines using critical thinking skills...

Course
...Implement evidence-based nursing care to promote health and self-care behaviors in patients with mental health needs using the knowledge, skills, and attitudes of the quality and safety education for nurses’ initiative.

General Education - Level Assessment

The general education level assessment explores how well undergraduate students are achieving the general education learning goals.

The general education can be considered as a "curriculum" compared to a program area for the purpose of assessment.
What is a curriculum map?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address Program Outcomes 1-4</th>
<th>International Education Administration Courses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1, 3, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 501 Introduction to School Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 580 Innovative Practices in International Education Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2</td>
<td>MIEA 515 Negotiation, Communication and Mediation to Improve Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2, 4</td>
<td>IED 582 Research Methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2</td>
<td>MIEA 502 Facilitating Teaching and Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 574 Research Project in Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2, 3, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 510 Leadership in International Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 564 Leveraging Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2, 3, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 537 Operational and Financial Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2</td>
<td>MIEA 530 Marketing of Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 520 Strategies for Change in International Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2, 3, 4</td>
<td>MIEA 587 Leadership Development Seminar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why do curriculum mapping?

- **Accreditation**
  - Program Design – How many opportunities does a student have to learn each of the program outcomes?
- **Communication Tool**
  - Full-time & Adjunct Faculty, Students, and Administrators
- **Teaching**
- **Strategic Planning**
- **Reflection Tool**
  - Identify strengths and opportunities for improvement.
Sample format of curriculum map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Outcomes</th>
<th>Required Courses</th>
<th>Pick Two Courses</th>
<th>Capstone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Effectively communicate in writing and through oral communication.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Demonstrate the critical inquiry and analysis skills needed to engage constructively in intellectual discourse within the criminal justice field.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Apply lessons and make connections between the General Education curriculum and the study of criminal justice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Design, execute, and present a personal project, which synthesizes and applies, selected knowledge, skills and experiences appropriate to the students’ personal and professional goals and/or their chosen area of specialization.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Demonstrate foundational knowledge of criminal justice and criminology, including practical and technical skills and competencies required by many law enforcement agencies and private security firms.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I: Introducing, D: Developing, C: Capstone

Phase 1: Identifying the level of learning: Introducing, Developing, and Capstone

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Outcomes</th>
<th>Required Courses</th>
<th>Pick Two Courses</th>
<th>Capstone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Effectively communicate in writing and through oral communication.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Demonstrate the critical inquiry and analysis skills needed to engage constructively in intellectual discourse within the criminal justice field.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Apply lessons and make connections between the General Education curriculum and the study of criminal justice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Design, execute, and present a personal project, which synthesizes and applies, selected knowledge, skills and experiences appropriate to the students’ personal and professional goals and/or their chosen area of specialization.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Demonstrate foundational knowledge of criminal justice and criminology, including practical and technical skills and competencies required by many law enforcement agencies and private security firms.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analysis & Discussion Points

✓ Adequate coverage across the map? Any gaps?
✓ Any need for restructure of course learning outcomes?
✓ Logical order: Introducing, Developing, and Capstone?
✓ Does each course contribute to one or more program outcomes?
✓ Is each program outcome addressed? From Introducing, Developing, and Capstone.

Curriculum Audit Identifying Gaps in the Curriculum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Outcomes</th>
<th>Q100</th>
<th>Q101</th>
<th>Q200</th>
<th>Q205</th>
<th>Q210</th>
<th>CHE 230</th>
<th>Q254</th>
<th>Q300</th>
<th>Q310</th>
<th>Q311</th>
<th>Q490</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Effectively communicate in writing and through oral communication.</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Demonstrate the critical inquiry and analysis skills needed to engage constructively in intellectual discourse within the criminal justice field.</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Apply lessons and make connections between the General Education curriculum and the study of criminal justice.</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Design, execute, and present a personal project, which synthesizes and applies, selected knowledge, skills and experiences appropriate to the students/ personal and professional goals and/or their chosen area of specialization.</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Demonstrate foundational knowledge of criminal justice and criminology, including practical and technical skills and competencies required by many law enforcement agencies and private security firms.</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What do we do with the gaps?

- Deep dive into the course student learning SLO’s
- Does SLO need to be revised?
- Do we need the course in the program?
- Is the level of learning proper? Bloom’s Taxonomy
  - Revising/rewriting course outcomes & submitting to curriculum committee (*Time-consuming process*)
  - Wait or keep going?

### Phase 2: Curriculum Maps & Planning:
**Which Outcomes will be Assessed? When? Which Course?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Required Courses</th>
<th>Q 19</th>
<th>Q 20</th>
<th>Q 21</th>
<th>Q 22</th>
<th>Q 23</th>
<th>Q 24</th>
<th>Q 25</th>
<th>Q 26</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Outcomes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Effectively communicate in writing and through oral/verbal communication.</td>
<td>I FA/19 SP/20</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C FA/19</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C SP/20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Demonstrate the critical inquiry and analysis skills needed to engage constructively in intellectual discourse within the criminal justice field.</td>
<td>I FA/18 SP/19</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D SP/21</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C SP/22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Apply lessons and make connections to the study of criminal justice.</td>
<td>I SP/20 FA/20</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I SP/20</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>C SP/23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Design, execute, and present a personal project, which synthesizes and applies, selected knowledge, skills and experiences appropriate to the students' personal and professional goals and/or their chosen area of specialization.</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Phase 3: Curriculum Maps & Planning:
Assignments used to Assess Program Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Outcomes</th>
<th>Required Courses</th>
<th>CJ 100</th>
<th>CJ 151</th>
<th>CJ 200</th>
<th>CJ 205</th>
<th>CJ 230</th>
<th>DJ 300</th>
<th>CJ 303</th>
<th>CJ 304</th>
<th>CJ 305</th>
<th>CJ 306</th>
<th>CJ 340</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Effectively communicate in writing and through oral communication.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Demonstrate the critical inquiry and analytical skills needed to engage constructively in intellectual discourse within the criminal justice field.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Apply lessons and make connections between the study of criminal justice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Design, execute, and present a personal project, which synthesizes and applies, selected knowledge, skills, and experiences appropriate to the students' personal and professional goals and/or their chosen area of specialization.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Discussion Points

- Are we collecting data at the right time(s)?
- Data Collection through the most appropriate medium?
- Type of Program:
  - **Undergraduate** *(Enrollment? Credit Transfer in?)*
  - **Graduate** *(Cohort Plan? Enrollment?)*
  - **Professional Studies** *(Enrollment? Credit Transfer In?)*

* Might impact your data collection points as you start to think about signature assignments. *
### Phase 4: Curriculum Maps & Planning: Rubric & Threshold

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Effectively communicate in writing and through oral communication.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Demonstrate the critical inquiry and analysis skills needed to engage constructively in intellectual discourse within the criminal justice field.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Apply lessons and make connections between the General Education curriculum and the study of criminal justice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Design, execute, and present a personal project, which synthesizes and applies, selected knowledge, skills and experience appropriate to the students’ personal and professional goals and/or their chosen area of specialization.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Lessons Learned: Mapping

- Illustrate program & institutional outcomes alignment
- **Transparent process** with stakeholders: Before, During and After
  - Establish a culture of *continuous improvement* and collaboration.
  - Emphasize the small wins, not the final win!
  - Balance academic freedom with the need for assessment
  - Develop your own model to achieve a culture of collaboration
  - Developed a 15 min video on how to use mapping (*one voice*)
Lessons Learned: Mapping

- Helps students visualize how courses and education fit into the program learning.

- Stimulate discussion & critical reflection on learning priorities
  - Logic of curricular design
  - Gap analysis
  - Methods to assess outcomes
  - Criteria & standards to judge artifacts

Lessons Learned: Mapping

No clear journey: Speedbumps, Alternative Route, Traffic, Accidents!

- The road does not end here!!

The assessment process is to improve student learning.

The goal of the assessment process is to allow for data-based decisions
Learning Outcomes Review:

- Steps taken to use curriculum mapping as an assessment tool  *(14 slides)*

- How curriculum maps identify program strengths and weaknesses within a shared governance assessment process  *(13 slides)*

- When and how program outcomes are assessed in each course, while creating an assessment cycle for assessment  *(10 slides)*

References


Contact Information

Dr. Paul Antonellis, Jr.
Director of Assessment - Office of the Provost
Endicott College
376 Hale Street
Beverly, MA 01915
USA
978-232-2602

pantonel@Endicott.edu

linkedin.com/in/drantonellis